

**EMERYVILLE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
ACTION RECAP**

THURSDAY, AUGUST 23, 2007

I. CONVENE, ROLL CALL, AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by Chair Martin. Commissioners present: Arthur Hoff, Gail Donaldson, Lawrence Cardoza and Angela Baranco. Commissioner Jeffery, excused absence. Commissioner Flores absent at roll call; arrived at 6:32.

II. CITIZENS TO BE HEARD

None

III. ACTION RECAP – July 26, 2007

Commissioner Baranco noted corrections on pages 3 and 5, and Commissioner Donaldson noted corrections on page 5. Commissioner Baranco moved approval and the motion was seconded by Commissioner Cardoza. Motion approved without exception, with the noted corrections.

Moved: Baranco
Seconded: Cardoza
Vote: Ayes: Flores, Hoff, Donaldson, Cardoza, Baranco, Martin
Absent: Jeffery

IV. DIRECTORS REPORT

Director Bryant reported on City Council actions at their August meetings. On August 7, the Redevelopment Agency approved and Owner Participation Agreement for the Oak Walk project, providing \$1.6 million in financial assistance to rehabilitate the five houses on 41st Street. As part of this discussion, the Agency decided to require the applicant to move the sidewalk to the north side of the street trees to provide bigger front yards. The City Council approved a contract with Nelson Nygaard for the Alternative Transportation Study. The Council also approved the fountain design by Masayuki Nagase for the Doyle Hollis Park. The Council approved the Final Development Plan for the West Elm Furniture store at Bay Street that was approved at the last Commission meeting. The Council revoked the cabaret permit for the Skybox Lounge due to ongoing problems and repeated warnings. The Council reviewed the preservation ordinances and decided to leave them as they are for now. The Council appointed Art Hoff to the General Plan Update Steering Committee as the third Planning Commission representative, and they appointed Ann Weber to the Park Avenue District Advisory Committee.

On August 21, the Redevelopment Agency approved a contract with ESA to prepare an Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration for the environmental remediation of Site B. The City Council heard an informational report on the Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) numbers and directed staff to write a letter to the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) saying it was too much, and giving us credit for our past accomplishments. The Council granted a noise waiver to allow quiet interior work at the Vue 46 project on Saturdays through the end of November; they will be doing painting and drywall work from 9:30 a.m. to 4:30 p.m. The Council considered a report on the noise ordinance, particularly with regard to the use of amplified sound and further restrictions on hours, and decided to defer action until the current labor dispute at the Woodfin Hotel is resolved. The Council revised the permit parking program to allow themselves to establish areas on their own initiative; and established an area on north side of 62nd Street between Hollis and Doyle; only new spaces will be permit; the existing number of spaces will remain non-permit.

The General Plan Update Steering Committee held its most recent meeting on Thursday, August 16, and continued going through the “change areas” one by one and debating the future land uses and building forms for development of a preferred plan. They got through area “I”, which is the East BayBridge shopping center. They have three areas left, which are the Bayfront areas north and south of Powell Street and the Peninsula. They will be discussing these areas at their next meeting on Tuesday, September 11. Then they will discuss transportation and open space policies at subsequent meetings. The Steering Committee has kicked into high gear, and is having two meetings per month, with three hours per meeting. Upcoming meetings are on September 11 and 25, and October 9 and 23, all from 6:00 to 9:00 p.m. Following development of a preferred plan, there will be a joint Planning Commission and City Council meeting to present and discuss it.

The Park Avenue District Advisory Committee held its most recent regular quarterly meeting on Wednesday, August 8. They reviewed the status of private projects and public improvements in the district, and the implementing ordinances. The committee decided to continue meeting quarterly until the Park Avenue improvements are built, and then to determine if they need to continue to meet. Ann Weber was appointed by the Council as a new resident member; there are still two vacancies, one resident and one business. Interested persons can download the application form from the City’s website and submit it to the City Clerk.

Director Bryant then reported back on items from the last meeting. He said he got an email from former Commissioner Paul Germain who said he is mending slowly from his bicycling accident; he responded back suggesting the September or October meeting for Paul’s “roast”, but has not heard back from Paul yet. In response to questions from last month’s meeting, Director Bryant distributed the official roster for the Emeryville/Oakland Joint Planning Authority for the East BayBridge shopping center, indicating which Commissioners are on it.

V. STUDY SESSIONS

- A. **Papermill Project, 5780 Hollis Street (UP07-07/DR07-11)** – A Study Session on a proposal to construct 177 residential units, 11 live-work units and 10,250 square feet of ground floor retail space in two buildings on a 2.35 acre site bounded east-west by Doyle Street and Hollis Street and north-south by Powell Street and Stanford Avenue. The existing two-story building on the western half of the site will be demolished. The brick façades on three sides of the existing one-story building on the eastern half of the site will be retained and incorporated into the proposed project. The existing City parking lot to the south of the site will be replaced by an extension of Stanford Avenue Park. CEQA Status: To be determined. General Plan Designation: Mixed-Use (M-U); Zoning Classification: Mixed-Use (M-U) (Applicant: Archstone Smith) (Owner: API Emeryville Parkside, LLC; Diversified Holdings; City of Emeryville) (APN: 49-1317-1-1; 49-1041-66; -67; and -68)

Senior Planner, Miroo Desai, presented the staff report. Rick Juarez, representing Archstone Smith introduced Kava Massih of Kava Massih Architects and Scott Foyer, the Landscape Architect. The group participated in a PowerPoint presentation.

Commissioner Baranco suggested they soften the look, she said the appearance was “box looking”. She said they should use something to compliment the new look, be creative and not try to mimic the old look.

Commissioner Donaldson asked for an explanation of how the pedestrians would get from Powell Street to the main entrance of the building. The applicant said they had not quite worked that out yet.

The public comment period was opened.

Judith Timmel, resident at 5514 Doyle said she appreciated the facade. However, there were a number of concerns she would like to have addressed:

1. With the entrance on Doyle Street, she is afraid parking will become an issue. She feels this will make for traffic congestion.
2. She is hoping the applicant will be asking for neighborhood input.
3. Huge number of housing for singles, but not for families.
4. Disappointed with the design.
5. Regarding the type of retail on Hollis, she would like a locally owned business there.

Ron Silberman spoke briefly. He wanted to know how the building height of this project compared with the Elevation 22 project. He said he was concerned with the amount of traffic, where it was going to be routed, and where it would flow. He also wanted to know if the parking would be shared or public parking.

Planning Director Bryant said staff would be looking at parking usage in the area as part of the environmental review process.

The public comment period was closed.

Commissioner comments included:

- ❖ Basic concept of building good
- ❖ Addition of canopies
- ❖ Encourage not having formal plantings, but a community garden
- ❖ Access to courtyard without having to go thru other people's areas
- ❖ Private decks look nice
- ❖ Bricks not worth saving
- ❖ More intense color
- ❖ Should have some 3-bedroom units
- ❖ Egress/Ingress on Powell difficult
- ❖ Disjointed for pedestrians internally
- ❖ Entry needs to reach out to public – more clear and welcoming
- ❖ Need to reduce density
- ❖ Needs community room
- ❖ Wrap S.W. corner in Building A
- ❖ Maybe incorporate a restaurant
- ❖ Make the lobby functional to tie in with ground level activities
- ❖ More visibility between Buildings A & B
- ❖ More glass in upper levels
- ❖ Eliminate some units and bring down to street level
- ❖ More creativity in design
- ❖ Sound and traffic concerns

Commissioner Martin said it would make sense to have another neighborhood meeting.

Commissioner Cardoza said there are major problems with this concept. He thinks the facade of the Hollis Street building should be preserved. He also thinks a better use could be derived from this building as an industrial building.

There was a break at 8:45. The meeting reconvened at 8:53.

- B. Gateway @ Emeryville Project, 5801-5861 Christie Avenue (UP06-17/DR06-27)** – A Study Session on a proposal to construct 265 for-rent residential units, a 143 room hotel, and 14,100 square feet of ground level commercial space on a 3.76 acre site bounded east-west by Christie Avenue and Interstate 80, and by Powell Street on the south. The proposed project site includes the adjacent Denny's restaurant and 76 gas stations sites, and the parking lot portion of the adjacent Kinko's site. CEQA Status: To be determined. General Plan Designation: Mixed-Use (M-U); Zoning Classification: Mixed-Use (M-U) (Applicant: BRE Properties, Inc) (Owners: BRE Properties, Inc., Denny's Realty, Inc.; Conoco Phillips; Orchards) (APN: 49-1494-2-2; -3-2; -4-7; -4-8; -4-10)

Senior Planner, Miroo Desai, made the staff presentation.

John Whalen spoke briefly and introduced other presenters who made a PowerPoint presentation. Rob Rees from Fehr & Peers, Charles Ellerat, LRM Landscape Architects, and Edward Yow.

The public comment period was opened.

Randy Lacey spoke briefly, representing the Sheraton Four Points Hotel. He complimented the presentation. He was concerned that another hotel is being allowed in Emeryville. He said more cooperation is needed to bringing more business to the hotels already in Emeryville. He requested the Commission take a hard look at whether another hotel is needed in Emeryville.

The public comment period was closed.

Commissioner Cardoza said he likes the improvements that have been made to this project, and would like to see more intense colors. He suggested they include some three bedroom units.

Commissioner Hoff said he likes the design.

Commissioner Baranco said she appreciates the attention given to the traffic flow details. However the color scheme is disappointing; also the hotel sign. Skylights could be an option to enhance the lighting. Access to open space and parks is what will attract people.

Commissioner Flores said it is a great spot for a high-rise. He likes the colors; however, they could be starker on a metal treatment. He would prefer a smaller and taller building without the hotel.

Commissioner Donaldson said this project has been improved from the last time. However, it still does not have the "punch" for a gateway project. The Powell Street facade is really disappointing. A plaza at Christie could be opened up more. She would love to see traffic improvements.

Commissioner Martin noted there was no crosswalk on the north side of Powell on Christie. Crosswalks on the corners would separate north and south bound traffic for pedestrians. He also said Shellmound/Christie/Powell, have cars backing out. This is a powerful opportunity to correct these problems. As far as the hotel concerns, he feels this building got plopped in this space. The treatment on the north and south is just offensive. He would like to see something interesting. It needs more work. The layout issue for trash needs to be resolved. The south west corner is the biggest design disappointment.

The applicant, John Whalen, said they will put some three bedroom units in the project.

VI. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. **Floor Area Ratio Increase, 1207, 1209 and 1211A 54th Street (UP 07-06)** – Conditional Use Permit to increase the floor area ratio (FAR) in excess of the allowable 0.5 in an existing triplex. CEQA Status: This project is exempt from environmental review under State CEQA Guidelines Section 15303(a), which applies to new construction or conversion of up to six multi-family dwelling units in urbanized areas. General Plan Designation: Medium Density Residential (M); Zoning District: Medium Density Residential (R-M). (Applicant/Owner: Tom Dannenberg) (APN: 49-1183-21) (Continued from May 24, 2007)

Planning Technician, Susan Summerford, made the staff presentation.

Applicant, Tom Dannenberg, spoke briefly.

The public hearing was opened. There was no one wishing to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Motion: To approve the request for the F.A.R. increase.

Moved: Cardoza

Seconded: Flores

Vote: Ayes: Flores, Hoff, Martin, Donaldson, Cardoza, Baranco
Absent: Jeffery

VII. COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS

Commissioner Hoff wanted to know how much consideration would be given to the Commission's recommendations not to approve a project because they did not like the project or felt a different project would be better for a particular site.

Director Bryant said the Commission must follow the legal guidelines in approving or not approving a project. Their decision must be based on the project that is before them, not what they would prefer to see. However, if they feel that they can't make the required findings for the proposed project, then they should vote to deny it.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT – The meeting was adjourned at 11:10